

# **PLANNING COMMITTEE**

# **MINUTES**

# **14 DECEMBER 2017**

Chair:	* Councillor Keith Ferry	
Councillors:	<ul> <li>* Ghazanfar Ali</li> <li>* June Baxter</li> <li>* Stephen Greek</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>* Graham Henson (2)</li> <li>* Pritesh Patel</li> <li>* Anne Whitehead</li> </ul>
In attendance: (Councillors)	Simon Brown	Minute 498

\* Denotes Member present

(2) Denote category of Reserve Members

#### 491. Attendance by Reserve Members

**RESOLVED:** To note the attendance at this meeting of the following duly appointed Reserve Members:-

Ordinary Member	Reserve Member
Councillor Christine Robson	Councillor Graham Henson

# 492. Right of Members to Speak

**RESOLVED:** That, in accordance with Committee Procedure Rule 4.1, the following Councillors, who were not Members of the Committee, be allowed to speak on the agenda item indicated:

1/01

<u>Councillor</u>	Planning Application
-------------------	----------------------

### 493. Declarations of Interest

**RESOLVED:** To note that the following interests were declared:

Agenda Item 10C: Major Applications (1/03: Former Cumberland Hotel, 1-3 St John's Road, Harrow)

Councillor Ghazanfar Ali declared a non-pecuniary interest in that he was a Council Appointed representative on the Board. He would remain in the room whilst the matter was considered and voted upon.

Agenda Item 10D: Major Applications (1/04: Premier House, Canning Road, Wealdstone)

Councillor Keith Ferry declared a non-pecuniary interest in that the applicant was one of the sponsors of Harrow's delegation to the Mipim Property Trade Show in March 2017. He would remain in the room whilst the matter was considered and voted upon.

# Agenda Item 10E: Major Applications (1/05: Central Depot, Forward Drive, Harrow)

Councillor Graham Henson declared a non-pecuniary interest in that he was the Portfolio Holder for Environment and the application site was within his portfolio. He would remain in the room whilst the matter was considered and voted upon.

### <u>Agenda Item 11H – Other Applications Recommended for Grant (2/08: 2</u> <u>Vaughan Road</u>)

Councillor June Baxter declared a Pecuniary interest in that the applicant was a Member of the Conservative Group. She would leave the room whilst the matter was considered and voted upon.

Councillor Pritesh Patel declared a Pecuniary interest in that the applicant was a Member of the Conservative Group. He would leave the room whilst the matter was considered and voted upon.

Councillor Stephen Greek declared a Pecuniary interest in that the applicant was a Member of the Conservative Group. He would leave the room whilst the matter was considered and voted upon.

#### 494. Minutes

**RESOLVED:** That the minutes of the meeting held on 22 November 2017 be taken as read and signed as a correct record.

#### 495. Public Questions, Petitions & Deputations

**RESOLVED:** To note that no public questions were put, or petitions or deputations received.

### 496. References from Council and other Committees/Panels

**RESOLVED:** To note that there were none.

#### 497. Representations on Planning Applications

**RESOLVED:** That in accordance with the provisions of Committee Procedure Rule 30 (Part 4B of the Constitution), representations be received in respect of items 1/01, 1/02, 2/02 & 2/05 on the list of planning applications.

# **RESOLVED ITEMS**

#### 498. Addendum

**RESOLVED:** To note that two addendums had been submitted and accepted.

#### 499. 1/01: Kodak, Headstone Drive, Wealdstone - P/4610/17

**PROPOSAL:** Approval Of All Reserved Matters For Development Plots A1, A2, A3 (Part A3(A) Only), A4, A5, Green Link And Central Green, And Approval Of Scale Only For Development Plot A3(B) Of Development Zone A Of The Harrow View East Masterplan And Details Pursuant To Conditions 7(Urban Design Report), 8(Energy Strategy), 9(Ecology And Biodiversity Strategy), 11(Housing Schedule), 12(Daylight And Sunlight Assessment), 13(Surface Water Drainage Strategy), 14(Accessibility Strategy), 15(Lighting 17(Noise Strategy), Strategy), 16(Refuse Strategy), And Vibration 19(Landscaping), 20(Transport 18(Arboricultural Strategy), Strategy), 21(Levels), 22(Open Space Strategy) Following Outline Planning Permission Granted Under P/2165/15 Dated 09.12.2015 For The Comprehensive Phased, Mixed Use Development Of Land Bounded By Harrow View And Headstone Drive (Known As Harrow View East).

Following questions and comments from Members, an officer advised that:

- although there would be some impact on the sunlight and daylight of properties opposite the proposed development, this would not be reasonable grounds for refusing the application as this loss was not deemed significant as it fell marginally below the recommended thresholds. Most of the windows would be north facing and would have a dual aspect;
- officers had been able to address the objection raised by the ESFA (Education and Skills Funding Agency) by recommending a new additional condition relating to the construction access to the proposed primary school.

A Member proposed refusal on the following grounds:

'The proposal causes harm to local character and amenity, by reason of inadequate design and excessive scale, contrary to policies DM1 and AAP6 of

the Local Plan, CS1 and CS2 of the Core Strategy, and 7.4, 7.6 and 7.7 of the London Plan.'

The Chair advised that the proposed height of buildings at the site was in accordance with the outline planning permission which had been granted in 2015.

An officer advised that it would not be advisable to refuse the application on the basis of the proposed height of buildings and if the matter were to go to appeal the Council could be liable for costs.

The motion was seconded, put to the vote and lost.

The Committee received representations from an objector, Pamela Swain and from a representative of the applicant, Alister Henderson, and Councillor Simon Brown.

The Committee voted on the officer recommendation to grant the application.

**DECISION: GRANTED**, planning permission subject to the Conditions listed in the officer report, and as amended by the Addendum.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was by a majority of votes.

Councillors Ghazanfar Ali, Keith Ferry, Graham Henson and Anne Whitehead voted for the application.

Councillors June Baxter, Stephen Greek and Pritesh Patel voted against the application.

# 500. 1/02: Intershop House, Lowlands Road, Harrow - P/4494/15

**PROPOSAL:** Redevelopment To Provide A Seven Storey Building With Replacement Employment Commercial Space Of Approximately 1058 Sqm On Ground Floor Level And First Floor Level (Use Class B1) And Forty-Eight Flats (Use Class C3) With Landscaping, Access, Parking, Bin And Cycle Storage.

Following questions and comments from Members, an officer advised that:

- there was a commercial unit on the ground floor and one on the first floor;
- the exact details of the Service and Delivery plan, which was covered by condition 20, were yet to be finalised;
- any future change of use from B1 (office) to C3 (residence) of the commercial units would require approval by the Planning Committee. Furthermore, the application would not have Permitted Development rights attached to it. Officers recommended that a condition be added

to the application which restricted the change of use of the ground and first floor commercial units to residential use via a Prior Approval application. (The Committee agreed that such a condition be added);

- the site was not located in a conservation area but rather was opposite one. There was a 5 storey office block on the site and the application sought to replace this with a 6 storey building with the 7<sup>th</sup> storey set back. Therefore the height of the new building would not be dissimilar to what was already there;
- in terms of design, the development would be a modern building which replicated the style of the existing block. Details of the external materials to be used were covered by a condition to ensure they were appropriate within the local context;
- condition 26 dealt with noise mitigation and ventilation and would ensure that the building was compliant with building control regulations.

A Member proposed refusal on the following grounds:

'The proposal would harm local character and amenity, including the settings of local conservation areas, contrary to policies DM1 and DM7 of the Local Plan, CS1 of the Core Strategy, and 7.4, 7.6 and 7.8 of the London Plan.'

The motion was seconded, put to the vote and lost.

The Committee received representations from an objector, Irene Wear and from a representative of the applicant, Frances Young.

The Committee voted on the officer recommendation to grant the application.

# **RECOMMENDATION A**

# **DECISION: GRANTED,**

- 1. permission subject to authority being delegated to the Divisional Director of Planning in consultation with the Director of Legal and Governance Services for the completion of the Section 106 legal agreement and other enabling legislation and issue of the planning permission and subject to minor amendments to the conditions or the legal agreement, as amended by the Addendum;
- 2. notwithstanding the provisions of Part 3 of Schedule 2 of The Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) (England) Order 2015, as amended by The Town and country Planning (General Permitted Development) (England) (Amendment) Order 2016, or any order revoking and replacing that Order with or without modification, no development that would otherwise be permitted by that part of the Order (or the equivalent provisions of any replacement Order) shall be carried out without planning permission having first been obtained by the local planning authority.

### **RECOMMENDATION B**

That if, by 30<sup>th</sup> March 2018 or such extended period as may be agreed in writing by the Divisional Director of Planning, the section 106 Planning Obligation is not completed, then delegate the decision to the Divisional Director of Planning to **REFUSE** planning permission for the appropriate reason.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was by a majority of votes.

Councillors Ghazanfar Ali, Keith Ferry, Graham Henson and Anne Whitehead voted for the application.

Councillors June Baxter, Stephen Greek and Pritesh Patel voted against the application.

### 501. 1/03: Former Cumberland Hotel, 1-3 St John's Road, Harrow - P/4332/17

**PROPOSAL:** Redevelopment Of The Former Cumberland Hotel ,Victoria Hall And Houses On Victoria Close To Provide 569 M2 For The New Victoria Hall Community Facilities (Use Class D2), 204 Residential Flats (Use Class C3), 78.9 M2 Floorspace For A Flexible Retail Unit Along St Johns Road (Use Classes A1-A4, B1, C3, D1 And D2) In Buildings Up To 16 Storeys In Height; A Pedestrian Link Between Sheepcote Road And St Johns Road And Associated Plaza; Basement And Ground Floor Servicing And Parking; Amenity Space, Hard And Soft Landscaping; And Plant Room

Following questions and comments from Members, an officer advised that:

 the applicant had engaged in considerable discussions with planning officers during the pre-application stage and the application had been assessed by both the Council's Design Team and an external Review Panel. The application site was located within one of the Council's Areas of Opportunity. The development would deliver much needed affordable housing and provide an enhanced community facility for local residents. The height of the new building would be comparable to Equitable House on Lyon Road.

Following a question from a Member regarding how the affordable housing units would be allocated, the Chair advised that the developer was a recognised social landlord and would allocate the units in accordance with its policies. The applicant had undertaken to offer the affordable units to Harrow residents before offering them to those from outside the borough.

A Member proposed refusal on the following grounds:

'The proposal is an overdevelopment which would harm local character and amenity, by reason of excessive height, scale, density, lack of parking and the impact on neighbouring properties, contrary to policies DM1 and AAP6 of the Local Plan, CS1 and CS2 of the Core Strategy, and 7.4, 7.6 and 7.7 of the London Plan.'

The motion was seconded, put to the vote and lost.

A Member stated that he would like to see local policies regarding tall buildings being adhered to. In his view, planning consent should only be given to those tall buildings which were of a high design quality.

Another Member stated that an overall environment strategy, which included waste disposal, bins, bin storage areas, recycling, food waste etc should be considered in a cohesive way during the initial stage of consideration of applications.

The Committee voted on the officer recommendation to grant the application.

# **RECOMMENDATION A**

### **DECISION:** GRANTED,

- 1) refer this application to the Mayor of London (the GLA) as a Stage 2 referral; and
- 2) subject to the Mayor of London (or delegated authorised officer) advising that he is content to allow the Council to determine the case itself and does not wish to direct refusal, or to issue a direction under Article 7 that he does not wish to direct refusal, or to issue a direction under Article 7 that he is to act as the Local Planning Authority for the purposes of determining the application delegate authority to the Divisional Director of Regeneration, Enterprise and Planning in consultation with the Director of Legal and Governance Services for the completion of the Section 106 legal agreement and other enabling development and issue of the planning permission and subject to minor amendments to the conditions or the legal agreement, and as amended by the Addendum.

#### **RECOMMENDATION B**

That if the Section 106 Agreement is not completed by 7th June 2018 or as such extended period as may be agreed by the Divisional Director of Regeneration, Enterprise and Planning in consultation with the Chair of the Planning Committee, then it is recommended to delegate the decision to REFUSE planning permission to the Divisional Director of Regeneration, Enterprise and Planning.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was by a majority of votes.

Councillors Ghazanfar Ali, Keith Ferry, Graham Henson and Anne Whitehead voted for the application.

Councillors June Baxter, Stephen Greek and Pritesh Patel voted against the application.

# 502. 1/04: Premier House, Canning Road, Wealdstone - P/4357/17

**PROPOSAL:** Creation Of A New Fifth Floor To Accommodate 17 HMO Single Occupancy Units With Shared Kitchens And Lounges (Sui Generis) And Shared Facilities For The Residents Of The C3 Areas Below For Co Working Office, Gym (114m2); Provision Of Refuse/Recycling Facilities And Cycle Parking; External Alterations At Ground Floor Level

Following questions and comments from Members, an officer advised that:

- the Highways Section had carried out a transport and highways assessment and had not raised any safety concerns relating to the development;
- there was a condition requiring refuse vehicles to access the site via the rear service yard.

The Committee voted on the officer recommendation to grant the application.

# **RECOMMENDATION A**

# **DECISION: GRANTED,**

- 1) planning permission subject to the Conditions listed in Appendix 1 of the officer report, and as amended by the Addendum;
- 2) the completion of a Section 106 agreement and other enabling development with the heads of terms set out below by 28th February 2018 (or such extended period as may be agreed in writing by the Divisional Director of Planning). Delegated Authority to be given to the Divisional Director of Planning in consultation with the Director of Legal and Governance Services for the sealing of the Section 106 agreement and to agree any minor amendments to the conditions or the legal agreement.

# **RECOMMENDATION B**

That if the Section 106 Agreement is not completed by 28th February 2018, or as such extended period as may be agreed by the Divisional Director of Regeneration, Enterprise and Planning in consultation with the Chair of the Planning Committee, then it is recommended to delegate the decision to **REFUSE** Planning permission to the Divisional Director of Planning.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

# 503. 1/05: Central Depot, Forward Drive, Harrow - P4767/17

**PROPOSAL:** Redevelopment To Provide Part Single, Part Two And Part Three Storey Building With Plant Room On Roof And Part First Floor Mezzanine Incorporating Workshop (B1 Light Industrial), Office (B1 Use),

Warehouse (B8 Use) And Ancillary Uses; Multi Storey Car Park And External Car Parking; Bin Store (Demolition Of Existing Buildings)

The Committee voted on the officer recommendation to grant the application.

**DECISION: GRANTED,** planning permission subject to authority being delegated to the Divisional Director of Regeneration, Enterprise and Planning to issue the decision following the expiry of the statutory consultation period and if require referral of the application to the Mayor of London at Stage 2 of the consultation process, and as amended by the Addendum. The application will be returned to the Planning Committee for determination if any significant objections are received to the proposals;

 Granted delegated authority to the Divisional Director of Regeneration, Enterprise and Planning to add/amend condition following the expiry of the statutory consultation period.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

# 504. 2/01: Royal National Orthopaedic Hospital, Brockley Hill, Stanmore - P/3955/17

**PROPOSAL:** Details Pursuant To Condition 4 (All Matters - Scale, Appearance, Layout, Access And Landscaping) Attached To Planning Permission P/3191/12 Dated 05/08/2013 For The Construction Of A Two Storey Hospital Link Building.

The Committee voted on the officer recommendation to grant the application.

**DECISION: GRANTED**, planning permission subject to the Conditions listed in Appendix 1 of the officer report and as amended by the Addendum.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

# 505. 2/02: 82 Rowlands Avenue, Harrow - P/4430/17

**PROPOSAL:** Single Storey Side Extension And First Floor Dormer At Side

Following questions and comments from Members, an officer advised that:

- there were a number of TPO (Tree Preservation Order) trees on site and no trees would be felled as a result of the development. The Council's Tree Preservation Officer was satisfied with the plans;
- officers were of the view that the proposed dormer would be proportionate to the original dwellinghouse.

A Member proposed refusal on the following grounds:

'The proposal would cause harm to local character and amenity, contrary to policies DM1 of the Local Plan, CS1 of the Core Strategy, and 7.4 and 7.6 of the London Plan.'

The motion was seconded, put to the vote and lost.

The Committee received representations from an objector, Charles Flattery and from a representative of the applicant, Andy Tyrrell.

**DECISION: GRANTED**, planning permission subject to the Conditions listed in Appendix 1 of the officer report.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was by a majority of votes.

Councillors Ghazanfar Ali, Keith Ferry, Graham Henson and Anne Whitehead voted for the application.

Councillors June Baxter, Stephen Greek and Pritesh Patel voted against the application.

# 506. 2/03: Car Park Rear of 15-19 Church Road - P/4078/17

**PROPOSAL:** Redevelopment To Provide Two Storey Building To Accommodate Six Flats; Underground Parking To Accommodate 12 Parking Spaces; Bin And Cycle Stores

Following questions and comments from Members, an officer advised that the 6 parking spaces which were currently under lease were not material planning considerations. However, in view of Members' concerns regarding a potential loss of the 6 spaces, it would be possible to insert an additional condition to the effect that the 6 residential parking spaces should be provided in perpetuity. The Committee agreed that such a condition be added.

The Committee voted on the officer recommendation to grant the application.

#### **DECISION: GRANTED,**

1. planning permission subject to the Conditions listed in Appendix 1 of the officer report, the additional condition agreed at the meeting of the Planning Committee as set out above, and as amended by the Addendum.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

#### 507. 2/04: 89 Stanmore Hill, Stanmore - P/4049/17

**PROPOSAL:** Redevelopment: Part Single Storey And Two Storey Building With Habitable Roof Space And Basement Level To Provide Offices (Class B1(A)) At Ground Floor And Basement Level; Two Studio Flats At Ground

Floor Level, And Four One Bedroom Flats On Upper Floors (Class C3); Bin And Cycle Storage; Demolition Of Existing Building.

The Committee voted on the officer recommendation to grant the application.

**DECISION: GRANTED,** planning permission subject to authority being delegated to the Divisional Director of Regeneration, Enterprise and Planning until the expiry period of consultation has been completed on 22nd December 2017, and as amended by the Addendum.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

#### 508. 2/05: 37 Glanleam Road - P/3009/17

**PROPOSAL:** Raised Patio And Steps At Rear (Retrospective)

Following questions and comments from Members, an officer advised that:

- works had begun at the site but these had been halted when the applicant realised that planning permission would be required. There was an enforcement action in place against the applicant, however, enforcement officers were awaiting the outcome of the planning application before proceeding with this. Under planning law, the applicant was entitled to apply for retrospective consent for the patio. It would therefore not be expedient to refuse the application on the basis of the enforcement action as the applicant would be likely to win the case if it went to appeal;
- a flood risk assessment had been undertaken and the application was deemed compliant and the Council's Drainage Team had not raised any objections;
- there was a typographical error on the report at paragraph 6.4.3 and the proposed development was in fact fully compliant with National Planning Policy Framework and other related policies. The officer undertook to correct the error in the report.

The Committee received representations from an objector, Martin Leigh, and from a representative of the applicant, Dipesh Shah.

A Member stated that there was some contradictory information in the report and some details in the report conflicted with statements made by the objector. He proposed a motion that the application be deferred subject to a site visit.

The motion was seconded, put to the vote and won.

**DECISION: Deferred,** subject to a site visit.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to defer the application was unanimous.

# 509. 2/06: Welldon Park Junior School, Wyvenhow Road, South Harrow - P/4193/17

**PROPOSAL:** Part Single Part Two Storey Building To Provide Increase From A Two Form Entry School To A Three Form Entry School; Provision Of Hard Play Area; Landscaping (Demolition Of Existing Hall And Kitchen Blocks).

The Committee voted on the officer recommendation to grant the application.

**DECISION: GRANTED**, planning permission subject to the Conditions listed in Appendix 1 of the officer report, and as amended by the Addendum.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

### 510. 2/07: 12-14 Station Road, Harrow - P/4436/17

**PROPOSAL:** Creation Of Additional Two Floors To Provide 5 Flats On Third And Fourth Floors (Class C3) (9 Flats In Total); Ground Floor Rear Extension And Continued Use Of Ground And First Floors As Educational/Healthcare (Use Class D1); Change Of Use Of Second Floor From Use Class D1 To Four Flats; External Alterations Including Balconies On 2nd Floor Level; Bin And Cycle Storage; Landscaping And Parking (Retrospective)

The Committee voted on the officer recommendation to grant the application.

#### **RECOMMENDATION A**

**DECISION: GRANTED,** planning permission subject to authority being delegated to the Divisional Director of Regeneration, Enterprise and Planning in consultation with the Director of Legal and Governance Services for the completion of the Section 106 legal agreement and other enabling legislation and issue of the planning permission and subject to minor amendments to the conditions (set out in Appendix 1 of the officer report) or the legal agreement.

#### **RECOMMENDATION B**

That if the Section 106 Agreement is not completed by 14th May 2018, or as such extended period as may be agreed by the Divisional Director of Regeneration, Enterprise and Planning in consultation with the Chair of the Planning Committee, then it is recommended to delegate the decision to REFUSE planning permission to the Divisional Director of Regeneration.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

# 511. 2/08: 2 Vaughan Road, Harrow - P/4184/17

**PROPOSAL:** Single storey rear extension

Councillors June Baxter, Stephen Greek and Pritesh Patel left the room during consideration of this item.

The Committee voted on the officer recommendation to grant the application.

**DECISION: GRANTED,** planning permission subject to the Conditions listed in Appendix 1 of the officer report.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

### 512. Member Site Visits

**RESOLVED:** To note that a site visit to 37 Glanleam Road - P/3009/17 would be arranged.

(Note: The meeting, having commenced at 6.30 pm, closed at 9.00 pm).

(Signed) COUNCILLOR KEITH FERRY Chair